



Quarterly Report
INDONESIA: ESTABLISHING DEMOCRATIC CIVILIAN
CONTROL OF THE MILITARY IN INDONESIA
USAID Grant No. AEP-A-00-98-00014-00
October 1 to December 31, 2000

I. SUMMARY

During the fourth quarter of 2000, NDI's program on governance and security in Indonesia focused on discussions with the Aksara Foundation on providing legislative drafting assistance to DPR Commission I, the second five-week Journalist Professional Development Program held jointly with the Dr. Soetomo Press Institute, and a series of seminars and meetings with the University of Indonesia (UI) and Gadjah Mada University (UGM) on reforming the National Resilience Studies curriculum into something more marketable and appropriate for a democratic Indonesia.

II. BACKGROUND

The state of civil-military relations has always been an important measure of the quality of a democracy. This is particularly true in Indonesia, which has a checkered history concerning democracy and civil-military relations. From 1950 to 1959, Indonesia experienced nine years of parliamentary democracy during a period characterized by independence, economic stagnation, and regional rebellions. As a result of these challenges and the fragmented party system, cabinets rarely lasted more than a year. In 1959, with the military's support, President Soekarno declared the executive-dominant 1945 Constitution back in force, ushering in 39 years of authoritarian government that ended only with President Soeharto's resignation on May 21, 1998.

The Indonesian National Military (TNI) has always seen itself as a military of the people, with an important role as a force for national unity. This belief is rooted in the military's role in gaining independence for Indonesia from the Netherlands between 1945 and 1949, and was later articulated in greater scope and detail as the ideology of *dwi fungsi* (dual functions). *Dwi fungsi*, unique in its ideological sophistication and historical justification, is the doctrine that specifically mandates a political and social role for the Indonesian military, in addition to the traditional military function of external defense.

President Soeharto and the Indonesian military used *dwi fungsi* during the New Order regime to justify the military's extensive role in politics and the withering of civilian control of the military. The resulting widespread corruption and human rights abuses have damaged the military's claims to popular legitimacy and thus compromised its credibility with both the political elite and the general public in Indonesia. This remains a serious problem for the sustainability of a democratic transition in Indonesia, both for military and civilian leaders.

It appears that there are senior officers within TNI who are committed to the reform process, both generally and as it applies to the military's role in politics. For instance, the military does not appear to have taken serious steps at any time in the last two and a half years to derail the overall reform process, despite being criticized in the media and by members of the civilian political elite. The police have been separated from the military as a step toward decreasing the military's role in domestic affairs, and TNI has diminished the role of the social-political affairs office that at one time was one of the most powerful offices of the military. Moreover, then-Armed Forces Commander and Minister of Defense and Security, General Wiranto, declared that the military would remain neutral during the June 1999 legislative elections, and it seems to have done so.

Nonetheless, few concrete steps have been taken to reduce the military's role in politics on an institutional basis. Although the number has been cut in half, the military insisted on retaining appointed seats in the national legislature and regional assemblies through 2004, and now an MPR decree assures their presence in the MPR through 2009. Many retired and some active officers remain seconded to the civilian bureaucracy. In addition, much of the repressive machinery of the New Order remains in place, even if it is not currently active. Furthermore, many observers believe that the military had begun to pull back from a commitment to reform in the months leading up to the October 1999 MPR General Session. For instance, the military responded in a repressive and often brutal manner to the situations in East Timor and Aceh. TNI also revealed plans to expand significantly the number of regional commands, a key part of military influence on politics.

In the first year of his presidency, Abdurrahman Wahid has taken some preliminary steps to reduce the political power of the Army and to re-establish civilian supremacy over the military. He promoted a Navy admiral as military commander and has filled other openings with Air Force marshals. There has been little further discussion of expanding the number of regional commands. In January 2000, President Wahid removed military spokesman Major General Sudrajat from his position after Sudrajat publicly questioned the president's authority as the commander-in-chief. In February 2000, Wahid removed General Wiranto from his position as Coordinating Minister for Politics and Security after an Indonesian human rights commission implicated him in the violence in East Timor. Nonetheless, with the erosion of his political support among civilian politicians, President Wahid has increasingly looked for support within the military, contributing to a rebound in TNI's political influence since June 2000.

One of the needs identified by both NDI and Indonesians for democratization is to have a larger pool of civilians with expertise in defense and security affairs. Currently, there are only a small number of such people, and most of them have had to study overseas to obtain the appropriate educational qualifications. At this time, there is no graduate program in Indonesia

that can produce civilian graduates with this knowledge base and skills. Nonetheless, a democratization efforts need such people to work in: (1) the Ministry of Defense, whose important decision-making officials are currently all active or retired military officers; (2) the national legislature (DPR) as professional staff, especially those that might eventually be attached to Commission I (the equivalent of the Defense or Armed Services Committee); (3) provincial governments, as security advisers to governors, who, with the implementation of regional autonomy policy and the state of emergency law, will have greater responsibility for local security; (4) universities, as lecturers and researchers; (5) think tanks, as researchers; (6) mass media, as military journalists; (7) NGOs relevant to the defense and security sector; and (8) other relevant institutions.

III. PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

1. Discussions with Aksara Foundation on Providing Legislative Drafting Assistance to DPR Commission I

Last quarter, NDI established a relationship with the Aksara Foundation, an Indonesian NGO that focuses on the promotion of civilian supremacy vis-à-vis the military. During the month of November, Aksara approached members of DPR Commission I, the committee on defense and foreign affairs, to discuss specific areas of assistance. In late November, Aksara submitted a draft proposal to NDI outlining its plan to provide legislative drafting assistance on defense and security issues to DPR Commission I.

2. Second Journalist Professional Development Program on Civil-Military Relations

In October and November, NDI, in conjunction with the Dr. Soetomo Press Institute (LPDS), conducted the second in its series of journalist professional development programs. In preparation for this seminar, NDI hired three consultants: Daud Sinjal, a retired senior journalist from the leading afternoon daily, Suara Pembaruan, Keith Loveard, with 32 years of journalistic experience, including the last decade as Indonesia correspondent for *Asiaweek*, and Mieke Kooistra, with 15 years of journalistic experience, including extensive experience in Southeast Asia. This five-week program was designed to improve Indonesian journalists' ability to cover the Indonesian military. The program consisted of a 3-day opening workshop that covered three themes: 1) civil-military and media-military relations in a democracy, and the reality in Indonesia; 2) technical information on the TNI; and 3) journalistic skills and standards. For the next five weeks, the journalists returned to their newsrooms to write articles analyzing an aspect of the TNI or a military issue, with assistance from NDI's team of consultants. The 3-day closing workshop gave participants the opportunity to discuss their experiences covering the TNI.

From October 13 to 15, NDI held the opening workshop in Bogor West Java. At this seminar, NDI was assisted by two expert panelists, Gen. (ret.) Jose T. Almonte, a former National Security Adviser and Director-General of the National Security Council in the Cabinet of former Philippine President Fidel V. Ramos; and Jim Della-Giacoma, an experienced journalist, who had spent many years in Indonesia and East Timor.

Eight prominent domestic speakers from the military, academia and the media also gave presentations at the seminar. These included Dr. Rizal Sukma, Director of Studies at the Centre for strategic and International Studies (CSIS); Maj.Gen. (Air Force) Graitto Usodo, Chief of the TNI Information Center; Let.Gen. Agus Widjojo, TNI Chief of Staff for Territorial Affairs; Dr. Indria Samego, Senior Researcher at the Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI); Dr. Kusranto Anggoro, Senior Researcher at CSIS and a leading expert on civil-military relations; Hendardi, Director of the Indonesian Human Rights and Legal Aid Association (PBHI); Lukas Luwarso, Executive Director of the National Press Council and Vice Chairman of the Southeast Asian Press Alliance (SEAPA); and Dr. Salim Said, leading observer of the Indonesian military.

Presentation topics included the following:

- Civil-Military Relations in a Democratic Society
- The Dynamics of Media Coverage of the Military
- Dialogue: Contemporary Media-Military Relations in Indonesia
- Film Discussion "*The Army Forced Them to be Violent*"
- Force Structure and Military Businesses in Indonesia
- Legal Reform, Military Doctrine and Civil-Military Relations in Indonesia
- The 1999 Press Law, the New Bill of Rights, Protection of Journalists and Press Freedom in Indonesia
- Techniques of Investigative Journalism
- The Dilemmas of Being a Journalist

Throughout the opening workshop, NDI/LPDS staff, international speakers, and consultants discussed article topics with the participants for the next phase: hands on training.

After the completion of the opening workshop, the journalists then returned to their newsrooms to start researching and investigating the topics they had selected. Over the course of the next five weeks, NDI sent four consultants, Keith Loveard, Mieke Kooistra, Daud Sinjal and Abdullah Alamudi from LPDS, to ten provinces to visit the participants at their respective newspapers. The consultants conducted individual newsroom consultations for each participant on the progress of their investigation, met with members of editorial boards and visited story sites to meet with pertinent authorities such as military officers, local government officials, and community leaders.

The Journalist Professional Development Program concluded on November 17-20 with a closing workshop held in Lido, Bogor, West Java. Based on an earlier suggestion from the Office of Transition Initiatives (OTI), NDI invited the participants from the first program in April and May of 2000. The workshop was attended by 30 of the 41 journalists from both programs. The October-November journalist participants reported on the stories they covered and the techniques used in covering their military-related issues during the past five weeks, while the April-May participants shared their work in the past six months and gave input on reporting and analyzing techniques. The participation of both sets of journalists helped build a community of expert military reporters in Indonesia.

3. Seminar on Reforming the National Resilience Studies Curriculum

Since May 2000, NDI has been assisting Gadjah Mada University (UGM) and the University of Indonesia (UI) in revising their national security studies curriculum, known in Indonesia as “National Resilience Studies,” into something more appropriate and marketable for a democratizing Indonesia.

As a follow up to the seminar at UI in late September, on October 2, 2000, NDI supported a half-day public seminar conducted by Gadjah Mada University to discuss the curriculum revisions. Amirsyah Sahil, program secretary for National Resilience Studies, who proposed “Strategic Studies,” as the new direction for UI’s program, represented UI. Reflecting the needs of a more decentralized Indonesia, UI sought to design the program with 60% national content and 40% local content. The goal of this program would be to educate students to have the skills necessary to work in the fields of regional and national development planning, policy analysis, and security and defense studies.

UGM was represented by Mohtar Mas’oed, a lecturer in International Relations, who proposed a “Regional Management” program with the goal of producing graduates who are skilled in conflict management and resolution in order to assist the conduct of democratic governance. The students in the M.A. program would focus on the following areas: (1) statecraft and governance; (2) local politics and governance; (3) conflict and cooperation theory; (4) conflict management and resolution; (5) ethnicity and community heterogeneity; (6) globalization and its effects on domestic politics; (7) democratization; (8) human rights; (9) regional economics; and (10) defense policy.

4. International Workshop on Reforming the National Resilience Curriculum

On November 8 and 9, 2000, NDI worked with both UI and UGM to develop the ideas that were presented at the September and October UI/UGM seminars through an international workshop. The first day of the workshop covered four topics: (1) the basic philosophy of the programs; (2) curricula; (3) market issues, from both the point of view of student recruitment and job placement; and (4) funding sources. The second day of the international workshop consisted of separate meetings with each university to hone their ideas from the previous day’s discussions.

At this workshop, NDI was assisted by Marcela Donadio, Director of Seguridad Estrategica Regional (SER en el 2000) from Argentina and Raymund Quilop, Assistant Professor from the Department of Political Science at the University of the Philippines. Discussions focused on the challenges to revising the UI and UGM curriculum, including how to generate student interest, new program goals, and the market for security and conflict resolution programs.

Over the course of this workshop, UI and UGM refined their specific program goals. UI decided to name its program “Security Studies,” and decided that students would take courses in politics, economics, and defense policy. UGM proposed a more flexible curriculum where students would take core courses in national security policy, conflict resolution, regional

management, or international security and then major in one area. UGM thought this general focus would attract more students.

Both universities have agreed that NDI can continue to provide support in the following areas: (1) assisting in the marketing of the new programs, especially through funding the production of brochures; (2) providing sample course syllabi; (3) assisting UI and UGM to obtain necessary course materials (books, articles, simulations, etc.); and (4) assisting in the establishment of an international student and faculty exchange program. In late November and early December the proposed programs was beginning to show internal approval from university officials at UI and UGM.

IV. RESULTS/ACCOMPLISHMENTS

1. Discussions with Aksara Foundation on Providing Legislative Drafting Assistance to DPR Commission I

- Began to discuss the outlines of a relationship between NDI and the Aksara Foundation; and
- Gained a greater understanding of DPR Commission I's needs.

2. Second Journalist Professional Development Program on Civil-Military Relations

- Strengthened the cooperative relationship with the Dr. Soetomo Press Institute (LPDS) in conducting this second of two training programs jointly;
- Brought together a diverse array of accomplished journalists, former and active government and military officials, and civil society leaders to conduct training and consultations;
- Visited ten regions to conduct consultations with the participants, their editorial staffs, military, and civilian groups in the area;
- Successfully enhanced Indonesian journalists' knowledge and skills with regard to civil-military relations in a democratic society, and fostered improved media coverage of the military;
- Developed an online mailing list for participants of the two NDI-LPDS workshops to share their stories and ideas on media-military relations and to seek advice from each other; and
- Assessed the future needs of Indonesian journalists regarding coverage of civil-military relations.

3. Seminars on National Resilience Studies Curriculum Reform

- Provoked university leaders and lecturers to focus on the necessary steps and analyze the challenges to reforming their national resilience studies curriculum;

- Brought different points of view together to examine how to reform the national resilience studies curriculum; and
- Aided university leaders in developing curricula for security studies at UI and conflict resolution at UGM.

V. EVALUATION/CONCLUSIONS

Objective: *To increase Indonesian legislators' and their staff members' ability to understand defense and civil-military issues.*

None of the activities conducted in this quarter were directly related to this program objective.

Objective: *To increase the Indonesian media's capacity to understand and accurately report on defense and civil-military issues.*

- Participants were actively engaged throughout the program, working with NDI's staff and consultants to apply the lessons learned to their work.
- Participants gained greater understanding of the techniques necessary for military analysis as the nation moves towards civilian supremacy.
- Participants discussed problems they face when covering the military and brainstormed solutions.
- Participants and NDI-LPDS formed an e-mail group to share articles and advice as the journalists work to apply what they learned.

Objective: *To increase Indonesian academic institutions' capacity to conduct research and education on defense and civil-military issues.*

- UI and UGM worked together to divide the broad subject matter and hone in on their specific program goals.
- UI and UGM developed specific curriculum for an M.A. program in security studies and conflict resolution and management, respectively.

Objective: *To increase long-term dialogue and understanding between the military and members of civil society.*

None of the activities conducted in this quarter were directly related to this program objective.

VI. FUTURE ACTIVITIES

1. Legislative Activities

- NDI will give a subgrant to the Aksara Foundation to support its efforts in providing legislative drafting assistance on defense and security issues to DPR Commission I.
- NDI will facilitate two dinners for the program participants to meet with a member of parliament from pertinent committees and civil-military experts. This program would enable the legislators to gain more of an understanding of public opinion on civil-military issues through their conversations with the journalists.

2. Follow On Activities to the Journalist Professional Development Programs

- NDI is currently selecting the best articles from the April/May and October/November programs for publication in a book.
- NDI will conduct an advanced course on investigative military journalism. Out of the current pool of 41 alumni of the original programs, NDI will select 10-16 of the most motivated and knowledgeable participants. Each participant in this advanced program would be required to design an investigative project on some aspect of TNI and conduct the investigation, with supervision from consultants.
- Out of the current pool of 41 alumni, NDI would send 1 or 2 of the most motivated participants to pair up with a military reporter in the Philippines for one month. The Indonesian journalist would be posted at a media outlet similar to where he/she works in Indonesia and would be partnered with a local journalist who covers the military. The Indonesian journalist would accompany the local journalist on his/her daily duties, gaining knowledge about the current state of media-military relationships in the Philippines and how that relationship has changed since the democratic transition began 15 years ago. The Indonesian journalist would be expected to send pertinent articles home to his/her publication periodically.

3. National Resilience Curriculum Reform

Both UI and UGM agreed that NDI's role going forward should consist of any or all of the following activities:

- Aiding UI and UGM to market their new programs;
- Providing sample course syllabi;
- Providing course materials such as books, articles, or simulations; and
- Helping UI and UGM to establish an international two-way exchange of students and lecturers.